

# Anharmonic Asymmetry: Solution

In **cycle notation**,  $(a_1 a_2 \cdots a_k)$  represents the permutation which cycles the elements  $a_1, \cdots, a_k$  of a set (in that order). For example, for a set  $\{1, 2, 3, 4\}$ , the permutation  $(123)$  is the function  $\rho$  defined by the input/output pairs

$$\rho(1) = 2, \quad \rho(2) = 3, \quad \rho(3) = 1, \quad \rho(4) = 4.$$

(Any element  $x$  not listed in the cycle notation is fixed, i.e.  $f(x) = x$ .)

There are six permutations of  $\{1, 2, 3\}$ , listed below with probabilities:

$$\begin{array}{cccccc} (1) & (23) & (31) & (12) & (321) & (123) \\ Z & A & B & C & X & Y \end{array}$$

When drawing a permutation from  $S_3$ , the probability it sends  $i \mapsto j$  is the sum of the probabilities associated with every permutation that sends  $i \mapsto j$ . This gives us a  $3 \times 3$  table of probabilities:

$\nearrow$	1	2	3
1	$A + Z$	$C + Y$	$B + X$
2	$C + X$	$B + Z$	$A + Y$
3	$B + Y$	$A + X$	$C + Z$

The  $ij$  entry is the probability of  $i \mapsto j$ . Since there is a 100% chance 1 is sent to one of 1, 2, 3 we may conclude the first row sums to 1; similarly there is a 100% chance one of 1, 2, 3 is sent to 1 so the first column also sums to 1. The same is true for all rows and columns, so the table is a so-called **doubly stochastic matrix**. In particular, all its entries ought to be  $1/3$ .

Setting the entries equal to each other results in many of the variables being equal. For instance  $A + X = A + Y = A + Z$  implies  $X = Y = Z$  and  $A + X = B + X = C + X$  implies  $A = B = C$ . Conversely, so long as  $A, B, C$  are equal and  $X, Y, Z$  are equal, the table's entries are all the same.

Thus, to get a nonuniform distribution on  $S_3$  for which  $i \mapsto j$  is equally likely for all pairs  $i, j$  it suffices to pick any solution of  $A + X = \frac{1}{3}$  for which  $A, X \geq 0$  and  $A \neq X$ , so such a distribution is possible.